

## Progress in RT1: Development of Ensemble Prediction System

## Aim

Build and test ensemble prediction systems based on global Earth System models developed in Europe, for use in generation of multi-model simulations of future climate

Coordinators James Murphy, Tim Palmer



- Separate systems for seasonal to decadal (s2d) and multi-decadal prediction
- Preliminary assessments achieved in reports delivered in March 06:
- s2d: Recommend further assessment and development of the multi-model, stochastic parameterisation and perturbed parameter approaches to the representation of modelling uncertainties.
- multi-decadal: recommend further development of the perturbed parameter approach, looking at how to combine the results with information from multi-model ensembles and observational constraints to produce probabilistic predictions.
- Major milestone due in August 06, describing "specified system" by month 24.



- Specifed system at month 60
- Will seek to extend the range of uncertainties sampled
- Improved methods of constructing probabilistic predictions
- Towards a single, generalised system for seasonal to centennial prediction ?



- 1.0: Management
- 1.1 Construction of Earth System Models
- 1.2 Methods of representing uncertainty
- 1.3 Initialising the ocean
- 1.4 Assembling the multi-model system
- 1.5 "pre-production" seasonal to decadal predictions
- 1.6 "pre-production" centennial predictions



- New earth system models constructed: testing (preliminary simulations, tuning experiments) in progress
- Further developments in methods for sampling model uncertainty and constructing probabilistic predictions.
- Initialisation procedures for "stream 1" seasonal-decadal integrations defined and used. Upgrading of ocean data assimilation systems for "stream 2" experiments continues.
- Ensembles of seasonal-decadal hindcasts produced, using the multi-model, stochastic physics and perturbed parameter approaches. Results saved in a common archive at ECMWF, and preliminary assessment of results conducted.
- Multi-decadal perturbed parameter ensembles using coupled models produced (Hadley) and in progress (Oxford). FUB have also performed short perturbed parameter runs.
- All deliverables and milestones met to date.



WP1.1 Construction of new Earth System models Partners: CNRS(IPSL+LGGE), DMI, INGV, METO-HC, MPIMET

Status: New earth system models constructed: testing (preliminary simulations, tuning experiments) in progress

ENSEMBLES needs ensembles of "ESMs" of reasonable size



Issues:

- Intended use (seasonal, decadal, centennial) vs. complexity Example: carbon cycle not relevant for seasonal predictions
- > Available models: many "simple" models vs. a few complex ESMs
- ➤ Time and computer limits: expensive models → small ensemble of integrations

Possible solution: build ensembles of different model classes, e.g.: physical system, carbon cycle system, aerosol system



# Three different forecast systems to estimate model uncertainty

- Multi-model, built from ECMWF, Met Office, Météo-France operational activities and DEMETER experience.
- Perturbed parameter approach, built from the decadal prediction system (DePreSys) at the Met Office.
- Stochastic physics, built from the stochastic physics systems developed for medium-range forecasting at ECMWF.
- 9 member ensembles: 22 seasonal or annual hindcasts from 1May and 1 Nov 1991-2001.
- Two decadal cases (1 Nov 1965, 1994) for multi-model, stochastic systems
- Decadal simulations for all start dates from DePreSys



- Update of the Metoffice Data Base:
  - Data available 1957-2004
  - Improved Quality control
  - Final data set including latest WOD05 data; available August 06
- New set of perturbations for Wind Stress and SST made available by ECMWF

Standard deviation of the SST perturbations based on uncertainties in the ocean analysis (NCEP ERSSTv2 and Hadley SST) before 1980 (from ECMWF)





- Update of the data assimilation systems:
  - Further scheme development and better tuning of system parameters (CERFACS, Meto-HC, INGV, IfM, KNMI)
  - More experimentations of the systems (ECMWF, CERFACS, METO-HC, KNMI)
  - · Test of the impact of the new perturbations in most systems

Variance in ensembles of analyses produced when perturbing wind stress, SST and ocean observations, relative to the variance produced by perturbing ocean observations alone. The differences are largest in poorly observed regions (from Cerfacs)





#### Archiving and dissemination strategy







# ENSEMBLES stream 1 seasonal simulations 1991-2000

### May & Nov start dates

### near-surface temperature and precipitation

### multi-model vs perturbed physics vs CASBS



#### seasonal forecasts 1991-2001 May & Nov start dates: mean drift

#### near-surface temperature Nino3









3 models à 9 members = 27 members



9 models à 1 members = 9 members



1 model à 9 members = 9 members



#### seasonal forecasts 1991-2001 May & Nov start dates: RMSE and spread

#### near-surface temperature Nino3





#### seasonal forecasts 1991-2001 May & Nov start dates: Anomaly correlation







ACC

#### persistence forecast



## seasonal forecasts 1991-2001 May & Nov start dates: Skill and spread

precipitation Nino3

multi-model

perturbed physics

#### stochastic physics





3 models à 9 members = 27 members







9 models à 1 members = 9 members



#### 1 model à 9 members = 9 members

RT1/2A Workshop, Reading, 8-9 June 2006



### December-February Precipitation bias (mm/day)



# IFS-HOPE control

IFS-HOPE with CASBS stochastic physics







### **ENSEMBLES** stream 1 decadal simulations

1965 & 1994 1991-1994

SST

### multi-model vs perturbed physics vs CASBS



#### decadal forecasts: mean drift



multi-model



start dates: 1965 and 1994



start dates: 1991 - 1994



start dates: 1965 and 1994



# Global annual mean temperature in perturbed physics ensemble hindcasts





## Skill in perturbed ensemble hindcasts vs earlier hindcasts using standard HadCM3 with perturbed initial conditions



Early results from experimental new systems: need to identify and correct problems for stream II simulations.



RT1 is focusing mainly on the development of perturbed physics approaches, assessed alongside multi-model approaches (RT2A, IPCC AR4, etc)



### New HadCM3 perturbed parameter ensemble

- Old ensemble (grey)
- New ensemble (black)
- HadCRUT observed series (red)
- Slightly wider range of feedbacks explored in new ensemble





### Pattern Scaling for Time-Dependent Change

- Distributions based on scaling the equilibrium pattern of climate change from 209 equilibrium experiments
- Uses an EBM
  Relationships trained using 17 coupled model experiments with same parameter perturbations
- Uncertainties propagated

Based on Harris, et al., 2006, Clim Dyn, in press



Median, 80, 90, 95%





## **Towards Time-Dependent PDFs**

 Including emulation at untried parameter values

 Assumes triangular distributions for most parameters

Based on Harris, et al., 2006, Clim Dyn, in press and Rougier et al. in prep.







## **Ocean Parameter Perturbation Experiments**



Changing these ocean parameters has little effect on the rate of timedependent climate change

Collins, Brierley, MacVean, Booth and Harris, submitted to J. Clim.



# HadCM3L 'Attribution' Project (courtesy Daithi Stone)

climateprediction.net and HadCM3 simulations past 1980





## **Perturbed Physics Approach at the FUB**

A 30 member perturbed physics ensemble was generated by varying 5 cloud parameters. (Sampling of the underlying uncertainties imperfect)

Parameters for the perturbations: (Comparable to studies with different models)

- 1) Conversion rate from cloud water to rain
- 2) Entrainment rate for shallow convection
- 3) Overshooting of cumuli above the level of non-buoyance
- 4) Sedimentation rate of ice crystals in cold clouds
- 5) Efficiency of rain formation

Aim: A probabilistic estimate of the Climate Sensitivity with the perturbed physics approach. A model comparison with other perturbed physics approaches.

1<sup>st</sup> phase: Integrations under 10yrs of present day conditions (finished) 2<sup>nd</sup>phase: Integrations under a doubling of CO2 (planned)



First results:

Strong linear behaviour of the global mean temperature to variations of the sedimentation rate

Non-linear behaviour in radiative quantities for multi parameter variations, especially with involved entrainment rate

Fig.1: Global mean temperature in the last 5 years of the RT1/2A Workshop, Reading, 8-9 June 2006 integrations in the ensemble of the perturbed EGMAM versions



## A methodology for observationally constrained probabilistic predictions (WP 1.2)



Constrains future climate variables using transfer functions between future variables and present day climate observables. Transfer functions developed from the cp.net perturbed parameter ensemble, but results are minimally sensitive to expert choices in the design of the ensemble.

Piani et al., 2005





- Assessment of stream 1 experiments (s2d, centennial)
- Plans for stream 2 simulations
- Observational constraints for ensemble predictions (links to RT4/5).
- Regional predictions (RT2B/3)
- Emissions scenarios (RT7)



- D1.5 WP1.1 workshop (this meeting)
- D1.6 Report on developed and tested ESMs Aug 06
- D1.7 Interim probability distributions of transient climate change over Europe, for use by other RTs in testing methodologies for predicting impacts Aug 06
- M1.4 Updated quality-controlled oceanographic database (Agreed delay till Aug 06)
- MM1.1 Provision of a set of tested Earth System models Aug 06
- MM1.2 Provision of a "first generation" ensemble prediction system for use in RT2 Aug 06









# Towards PDFs of regional climate change from perturbed physics ensembles of global models

## (1)

- Take one model (version 3 of the Hadley Centre Atmosphere model coupled to a mixed layer ocean – HadSM3)
- Ask the model experts for ranges on uncertain parameters
- Run an ensemble of equilibrium climate change simulations



## (3)

 Run a smaller ensemble of transient simulations using a subset of perturbed atmospheres coupled to the dynamical HadCM3 ocean





#### Frequency distributions of transient regional changes

(5)

 Develop scaling relationships between the equilibrium and transient responses and use to infer results of a larger ensemble of transient simulations from the equilibrium ensemble

## (6)

- Gives frequency distributions of time dependent changes for regions of choice
- E.g. precip changes over Giorgi regions in DJF





#### Formal Bayesian framework for probabilistic prediction

## (7)

Take an expert prior for uncertain model parameters

- Construct a prior for climate change variables using a statistical *emulator* to predict GCM results for unsampled regions of parameter space
- Introduce the *discrepancy*, the difference between the observed climate and the best possible model version obtainable by varying parameters. It measures uncertainty arising from structural model deficiencies.
- Estimate (a lower bound for) *discrepancy* by using perturbed physics ensemble results to predict multi-model ensemble results
- Calculate the likelihood and hence produce posterior distributions for future climate variables

## $p(s \mid data) \propto p(s) p(data \mid s)$

*posterior* = *prior* x *likelihood* 





- RT1 will construct a methodology for producing pdfs of regional changes based on perturbed physics ensembles of global models
- We propose an interim product by month 24, consisting of distributions of changes in selected regional variables for Europe, for the A1B forcing scenario, for use by other RTs in testing methodologies for predicting impacts.
- These will account only for surface and atmospheric modelling uncertainties, and will not account for variations in likelihood between different model versions.
- Beyond month 24:
- Hope to use multi-model ensemble results in the construction of likelihoodweighted pdfs, to calibrate the effects of structural model deficiencies.
- Include modelling uncertainties arising from oceanic physical processes, and the terrestrial carbon cycle and atmospheric sulphur cycle, through further ensembles and statistical emulation.